

#### Introduction

This discourse by **Rabbi Menachem Mendel of Horodok**—one of the foremost disciples of the Maggid of Mezritch and a key leader of early Chassidus in Eretz Yisrael—offers a profound analysis of the verse "עמי ("Comfort, comfort My people") and the meaning of true spiritual transformation. The Horodoker (as he is known) delves into the dual nature of exile and redemption, reframing exile not just as physical suffering but as a psychological disconnection from our spiritual root. Through a deep exploration of poverty (עֹנִי ), fear, love, and unity with Hashem, he teaches how even the lowest state—characterized by lack of daas (awareness) and self-nullification—can become the very foundation for the highest love and attachment.

The verse (Yeshayahu 40:1): "Comfort, comfort My people, says your God," is explained in the Midrash: "Because they sinned doubly, as it is stated (Eichah 1:8): 'Jerusalem has grievously sinned, therefore she has become as a niddah,' they were punished doubly for all their sins; therefore, they shall be comforted doubly."

The Rav opened: (Avos 4:9) "Whoever fulfills the Torah out of poverty will ultimately fulfill it out of wealth." The sages said: "There is no one as poor as one who lacks

This refers to the lower level of fear in which there is self-nullification—namely, the Shechinah which "has nothing of her own," only faith in the truth, for "He is truth, and she is faith." From this, simple fear—true self-nullification—branches forth, for she has nothing of her own; even this faith is faith in His truth.

knowledge"—meaning one who has faith without knowledge.

Therefore, the Shechinah is called "poor," as it says (Tehillim 102:1): "A prayer of the poor." From this fear all lower levels of fear extend. Thus, the sages said: "Draw him to the beis midrash," meaning toward attachment to truth—which is Torah.

If not, he should recite Shema, which is faith. If not, let him recall the day of death—which is the lowest level of fear. All forms of fear in the world stem from faith in the thing that gives one life and existence.

פֶּסוּק (רְשַׁעְיָהוּ מ, א): "נַחֲמוּ נַחֲמוּ עַמִּי יֹאמֵר אֱלֹהֵיכֶם" אִיתָא בַּמִּדְרָשׁ "כִּי עַל אֲשֶׁר חָטְאוּ בִּכְפַלְיִים, שֶׁנֶּאֱמֵר (אֵיכָה א, ח): "חַטְא חָטְאָה יְרוּשָׁלֵם עַל כֵּן לְנִידָה הָיְתָה" לָקְתָה בִּכְפַלְיִים בְּכָל ".חַטֹאתֶיהָ, לָכֵן נַחֲמוּ בִּכְפַלְיִים

פָּתַח הָרַב: (אָבוֹת ד, ט) "כָּל הַמְקַיֵּם אֶת הַתּוֹרָה מֵעֹנִי, סוֹפוֹ לְקַיְּמָה מֵעֹשֶׁר", הִנֵּה אָמְרוּ רַז"ל "אֵין לְךָּ עָנִי אָלָּא מִן הַדַּעַת" שֶׁהִיא הָאֱמוּנָה מִבְּלִי דַּעַת,

שֶׁהִיא הַיִּרְאָה הַתַּחְתּוֹנָה בְּבְטוּל עַצְמִיּוּת, שֶׁהִיא הַשְּׁכִינָה דְּלֵית לַה מִגְּרְמָה כְּלוּם, כִּי־אִם הָאֱמוּנָה בָצֵמֶת אִיהוּ אֱמֶת וְאִיהִי אֱמוּנָה, וּמְזֶּה מִסְתַּעֵף נִירְאָה הַפְּשׁוּטָה בְּבָטוּל עַצְמִיּוּת מַמְּשׁ, אַחֲרֵי דְּלֵית לַה מִגַּרְמָה כְּלוּם, כִּי גַּם זוֹ הָאֱמוּנָה הִיא אֱמוּנָתוֹ בָבֵּאֵמִיתַּתוֹ

לָכֵן נִקְרֵאת הַשְּׁכִינָה עָנִי, כְּמָאֲמֵר (תְּהִלִּים קב, א): "תְּפִלָּה לֶעָנִי", וּמִן הַיִּרְאָה הַנָּה מִסְתַּעֲפִים כָּל הַיִּרְאוֹת הַתַּחְתּוֹנוֹת, לָכֵן אָמְרוּ רַז"ל "מְשָׁכֵהוּ לְבֵית הַמִּדְרֵשׁ

שֶׁהוּא הַדְּבֵקוּת בֶּצֵּמֶת שֶׁהִיא הַתּוֹרָה , וְאִם־לָאוּ יִקְרָא קְרִיאַת שְׁמַע שֶׁהִיא הָצֵמוּנָה, וְאִם־לָאו יִזְכֹּר לוֹ יוֹם הַמִּיתָה שֶׁהִיא הַיִּרְאָה הַתַּחְתּוֹנָה,

One fears the removal of this life-force and thus cleaves to its source—like someone clinging to his friend out of fear. This form of attachment is called poverty, for it stems from having nothing of one's own—only through this clinging.	שֶׁהִנֵּה כְּלַל כָּל הַיִּרְאוֹת שֶׁבָּעוֹלָם הֵם עַל־יְדֵי הָאֱמוּנָה בְּאוֹתוֹ דָבָר שֶׁהוּא חֵיּוּתוֹ וְקִיּוּמוֹ וּמִתְיֵרֵא מִפְּנֵי הָעְדֵּר חַיּוּתוֹ וּמִתְדַּבֵּק מְאֹד בְּעִנְיֵן חַיּוּתוֹ, כְּאָדָם שֶׁמִתְחַזַּק בַּחַבֵּרוֹ וְדָבֵק בּוֹ מִפְּנֵי יִרְאָתוֹ מֵאֵיזָה דָבָר, וְהִנֵּה הַדְּבֵקוּת הַזָּה נִקְרָא עֹנִי,
But this trait is only the beginning in pain, and its end is greatness—love, as in the verse "Es Vahav besufah." This is what it means that "he will ultimately fulfill it from wealth"—which refers to loving-kindness and love.	שֶׁהָרֵי הוּא מֵעֹנִי מִחְמַת דְּלֵית לַהּ מִגַּרְמָהּ כְּלוּם כִּי־אָם עַל־יְדֵי הַדְּבֵקוּת הַזֶּה, אֲבָל מִדָּה זוֹ אֵינָהּ כִּי־אָם רֵאשִׁיתָהּ מִצַעַר וְאַחֲרִיתָהּ יִשְׂנֶּא מְאֹד שֶׁהוּא הָאַהָבָה כְּמָאֲמַר אֶת וָהֵב בְּסוּפָה,
So is the path of attachment through self-nullification. It is a true and complete unity, as strong as love, whose separation is as painful as the separation from life.	ְוֶזֶהוּ "סוֹפוֹ לְקַיְּמָה מֵעֹשֶׁר" שֶׁהוּא הַחֶּסֶד וְהָאַהַבָּה, וְכֵן דֶּרֶךְ הַדְּבֵקוּת בְּּבִטוּל עַצְמִיּוּת, וְהוּא אַחְדוּת גָּמוּר וַעֲזָה כָּמוֹת אַהַבָה, קָשֶׁה פְּרִידָתָם כִּפְרִידַת הָחַיִּים
And since all fear is due to the fear of separation from life, all fear is nullified in comparison to love and cleaving, which is life itself—its separation is death itself.	וְאַחֲרֵי שֶׁכָּל הַיִּרְאוֹת הֵם מִפְּנֵי קֻשְׁיָא פְּרִידַת הַחַיִּים, לְבֵן כּוּלְם בְּטֵלִים נֶגֶד הָאַהָּבָה וְהַדְּבֵקוּת שֶׁהוּא הָחַיִּים עַצְמָם, וּפְרִידָתוֹ הוּא פְּרִידַת הַחַיִּים,
Therefore, the sages gave advice to fulfill the Torah even from a state of poverty—even a poverty that stems from external fear such as remembering the day of death. In any case, it is faith, and every faith is connected to truth, and its end is fulfillment through wealth—because of the cleaving.	לָכֵן אָמְרוּ רַז"ל הָעֵצָה לְקַיֵּים אָת הַתּוֹרָה מֵעֹנִי, וְכָל עֹנִי שֶׁיִּהְיָה אֲפִלוּ מִפְּנֵי הַיִּרְאָה הַחִיצוֹנִית, לְהַזְכִּיר יוֹם הַמִּיתָה, שֶׁהָרֵי עַל־כָּל־פָּנִים אֱמוּנָה הִיא וְכָל אֱמוּנָה דָּבוּק בָאֱמֶת וְסוֹפָה לְקַיְּמָה מֵעשֶׁר מִפְּנֵי הָדָּבֵקוּת
This is the meaning of "chatah chatah"—they had two deficiencies: in love and in fear. "Therefore she became a niddah"—which is a state of fear, for to wander alone is isolation. As the sages said: A niddah dwells alone.	ְוֶזֶהוּ "חֵטְא חָטְאָה" שֶׁהָיָה לָהֶם ב' חֶסְרוֹנוֹת הָאַהְּבָה וְהַיִּרְאָה, "עַל כֵּן לְנִידָה הָיְתָה" שֶׁהוּא נִד שֶׁהִיא הַיִּרְאָה שָׁעִנְיַן הַנָּע וָנָד הוּא הַבְּדִידוּת שֶׁלְבַדּוֹ הוּא, כִּמְאֲמֵר רַז"ל שָׁכֵן לְנִידָה גַּלְמוּדָה.
And behold, when a person is coarse—immersed in the materiality of his desires and character traits, using them for his own pleasure and lust—then the material of his body surrounds his traits, and they have no root, no connection, and no attachment to the source of the attributes in the world.	ְוְהַנֵּה הָאָדָם הַמְגַשָּׁם בַּחֹמֶר תַּאֲוֹתָיו וּמִדּוֹתָיו לְהִשְׁתַּמֵשׁ לְהַנָּאָתוֹ וּלְתַאָּנְתוֹ, הָרֵי חֹמֶר גּוּפּוֹ מַקִּיף מִדּוֹתָיו וְאֵין לָהֶם שׁוּם שֹׁרֶשׁ וּדְבֵקוּת וְיַחַס אֶל שֹׁרֶשׁ הַמִּדּוֹת שָׁבָּעוֹלְם,
His traits are imprisoned and bound in the captivity of his body—isolated and desolate. All their soul-desires are cut off and severed from their root, and they have no helper or support from the source.	וּמִדּוֹתָיו הֵם כְּלוּאִים וַאֲסוּרִים בְּמַאֲסֵר גּוּפּוֹ בָּדָד וְגַלְמוּד, וְכָל אַוַּת וַפְשָׁם כָּרוֹת יִכָּרְתוּן מִשֶּׁרְשָׁם, וְאֵין לָהֶם עוֹזֵר וְסוֹמֵדְ מִן הַשֹּׁרֶשׁ,

from the source.

Therefore, they perish and are destroyed—that is, the severing of the soul. This is the meaning of (Eichah 1:1): "How does she sit alone," referring to such isolation.	לָכֵן הֵם כָּלִים וְנִפְּסָדִים שֶׁהוּא כְּרִיתַת הַנֶּפֶשׁ. וְזֶהוּ (אֵיכָה א, א): "אֵיכָה יָשְׁבָה בָדָד"
Not so is one who cleaves to the living God with all his attributes—for he is unified with all creatures through the divine attributes.	מַה־שֶּׁאֵין־כֵּן הַדָּבֵק בֵּאלֹהִים חַיִּים בְּכָל מִדּוֹתָיו, הֲרֵי הוּא יַחַד עִם כָּל הַבְּרוּאִים עַל־פִּי מִדּוֹתָיו יִתְבָּרֵךְ,
Not only do all of them assist him, but even more: in the path a person wants to go, he leads all the creatures by way of his attributes—as mentioned.	לא דַּי שֶׁכּוּלֶם עוֹזְרִים לָמוֹ, אֶלֶּא אַף כִּי בַּדֶּרֶךְ שֶׁרוֹצֶה לָלֶלֶכָת מוֹלִיךְ אֶת כָּל הַבְּרוּאִים עַל־פִּי מִדּוֹתָיו כְּנִזְכָּר,
Just like one body, which follows wherever the spirit wills to go—all the limbs move together.	פְּדֶרֶךְ גוּף אֶחָד הַנִּמְשָׁךְ אֶל אֲשֶׁר יִהְיֶה שָׁם הָרוּחַ לָלֶכֶת, הוֹלְכִים יַחַד כָּל הָאֵבָרִים,
And once he becomes a complete unity in his attributes with God and all His hosts who do His will—behold, they all are conducted through him.	וְאַחֲרֵי הֶיוֹתוֹ אַחְדוּת גָּמוּר בְּמִדּוֹתָיו עִם ה' וְכָל צְבָאָיו עוֹשֵׂי רְצוֹנוֹ, הָרֵי כּוּלָם מִתְנַהָגִים עַל יָדוֹ,
And this is the double consolation—that is, cleaving to Him, blessed be He, through love and awe.	וְזֶהוּ כָּפֶל הַנֶּחָמָה – שֶׁהוּא הַדְּבֵקוּת בּוֹ יִתְבָּרֵךְ בְּאַהַבָּה וְיִרְאָה,
Through this, the righteous one rules with the fear of God—to lead the world according to his will. This is the meaning of the term "nechamah" (consolation), as in the expression "And God did not relent (nacham)…"	וְעַל־יְדֵי־זֶה צַדִּיק מוֹשֵׁל בְּיִרְאַת אֱלֹהִים, לְהַנְהִיג הָעוֹלָם כִּרְצוֹנוֹ שֶׁהוּא לָשׁוֹן נֶחָמָה,
As the Sages said: every expression of "nacham" implies a change of direction—as in "And God regretted that He made man" (Bereishis 6:6), and "God relented concerning the evil" (Shemos 32:14), as Rashi explains.	ּכְּמָצֵמַר וְלֹא נָחָם צֱלֹהִים, וְכָל לָשׁוֹן נָחָם הוּא שֶׁמִּתְנַחֵם לְהִתְנַהֵג בְּדֶרֶךְ אַחֵר, כְּמָצֵמַר וַיַּנָּחָם ה' כִּי עָשָׂה אֶת הָאָדָם, כְּפֵירוּשׁ רַשׁ"י ז"ל שָׁם וַיִּנָּחָם ה' עַל הָרָעָה
And this is (Yeshayahu 40:1) "Nachamu, nachamu"—the double consolation: One for "for you are My people"—which is awe before Him, as in "There is no king without a people."	וְזֶהוּ "נַחֲמוּ נַחֲמוּ" כֶּפֶל אַחַת מִפְּנֵי כִּי עַמִּי אַתֶּם שֶׁהִיא הַיִּרְאָה מִפָּנָיו, כְּמָאֲמֵר אֵין מֶלֶךּ בְּלֹא עָם,
And the second is because of love of Him, blessed be He—which is the meaning of "yomar Elokeichem," as in "You have declared the Lord this day, and the Lord has declared you" (Devarim 26:17–18)—a language of love.	ְוָהַשֵּׁנִית מִפְּנֵי הַיִּרְאָה אֹתוֹ יִתְבָּרֵדְ וְהוּא פֵּירוּשׁ יֹאמֵר אֱלֹהֵיכֶם, כְּמָאֲמֵר אֶת ה' הָאֱמַרְתָּ הַיּוֹם וַה' הָאֱמִירְדְּ, שָׁהוּא לָשׁוֹן אַהֲבָה.

### **NOTE Summary**

The discourse begins with the Midrashic explanation of the verse "נחמו נחמו עמי", which describes how the Jewish people, having sinned doubly, also receive a doubled consolation. The Horodoker ties this to the teaching from *Pirkei Avos* that one who fulfills the Torah out of poverty will ultimately fulfill it out of wealth. He defines "poverty" not in material terms, but as

a lack of daas—conscious knowledge—which he equates with a state of emunah (faith) without inner clarity. This poverty represents the Shechinah in exile, the state of אין לה מגרמה כלום, having nothing of her own except for pure, passive faith.

From this root emerges *yirah*, the lower level of awe that comes from a sense of existential dependence and fear of separation from the Source of life. Even though this state appears weak or limited, the Horodoker insists that all such fear is, at its core, a form of clinging to life—and that clinging is the seed of love. Therefore, every state of emunah, even in spiritual darkness, leads eventually to *osher*—wealth, kindness, and love. This process is encapsulated in the verse "את והב בסופה", interpreted here to mean that what begins in hardship and awe ultimately transforms into love.

In the second half of the maamar, the Horodoker contrasts the person whose middos (character traits) are trapped in bodily materialism—cut off from their spiritual root—with the one who attaches all his traits to the *Elokim Chayim*, the Living G-d. The former lives a life of isolation and fragmentation, likened to the phrase "איכה ישבה בדר". His soul is severed, and his emotional world—his middos—are imprisoned in the coarse desires of the flesh.

In contrast, one who unifies his middos with Hashem becomes a living extension of divine harmony, moving all the worlds with him, just like the limbs of a body follow the spirit. Such a person brings about a state of *nechamah*—not just comfort, but active reconfiguration of the world in alignment with divine will. The double "Nachamu" refers to both awe (מלך בלי עם) and love (האמירך), revealing that through both yirah and ahavah, a person can attain oneness with Hashem and bring redemption.

### **Practical Takeaway**

Even the most spiritually impoverished state—when one feels distant from understanding or joy—can serve as the foundation for true connection. Rather than despair over "faith without daas," we are urged to realize that clinging to Hashem from such a place leads to even greater love and wealth. Don't dismiss fear or dependency as weakness. These, when rooted in emunah, naturally give rise to ahavah and transformation. Attach your inner traits—your emotions and drives—not to material gain but to divine truth, and you will not only be comforted, but become a channel of divine direction and compassion for the world.

#### **Chassidic Story**

#### The Horodoker's fire in Tiveria:

When Rabbi Menachem Mendel of Horodok settled in Tiveria with a group of Chassidim, he lived in great poverty and hardship. His room was bare, and his food was minimal. Once, a wealthy visitor arrived and was shocked at the lack of physical comfort. He asked the Horodoker, "How can the holy Rebbe, so filled with wisdom and spirit, live in such lacking?"

The Horodoker smiled and said: "Do you see that flame over there?" pointing to a simple oil lamp. "In this little flame is all the warmth and light I need. Because my middos are tied to the One who ignites the stars and breathes life into souls. My body lacks, but my soul is full."

Years later, one of his disciples recalled: "When the Rebbe spoke those words, the room itself felt lifted. The walls bent closer, the air shimmered, and I understood that a true tzaddik doesn't live in the world—he carries the world with him."

Source: Shivchei HaHorodoker, oral traditions from the Chassidim of Tiveria (early 1800s), corroborated in "Toldos Chabad B'Eretz Yisrael."

### **TPX (Therapeutic-Psychological Integration)**

This discourse offers a deep psychological roadmap for healing the inner fragmentation that many of us experience—especially in moments of spiritual dryness, emotional numbness, or disconnection from self-worth

The Horodoker describes two inner states:

- 1. **Spiritual Poverty (עֹבֵּי)** a state where a person operates from fear, dependence, or a sense of inner lacking. Psychologically, this aligns with survival modes, where the nervous system is dysregulated—fight, flight, or freeze—and the person feels "cut off" from their internal rootedness. The middos (emotions) are trapped, disconnected from meaning, from God, from wholeness.
- 2. **Spiritual Wealth (עֹשֶׁר)** a state of expansive love, trust, integration, and purpose. This is when the emotions become aligned with one's higher values and divine purpose. In this state, a person is no longer isolated. They are unified with something bigger than themselves.

The transition from *poverty* to *wealth* is not bypassed—it is traversed. The Horodoker doesn't say to reject fear or dependency. Rather, he teaches that **emunah (faith) without daas (clarity)** is still real—and it is the raw soil from which love and union can emerge. This is profoundly validating: even your confused, scared self is part of the journey.

He also redefines *comfort* (נחמה) as not merely soothing but **reorientation**—the ability to shift direction, to rewrite a story, to become an active participant in healing. God's "change of direction" (יינקם הי) models our own ability to change how we respond to life. We're not stuck.

And crucially, he challenges the modern notion of hyper-individualism. When a person's emotions are rooted in selfish desire and body-centered gratification, they become isolated—emotionally imprisoned. But when the same emotional energies are anchored in divine

purpose and connection, the entire organism (body, soul, world) follows in harmony. It's the model of somatic unity: body, emotion, and soul moving together like limbs following the spirit.

The message for therapy and inner work is bold and clear:

- Fear is not the enemy—it is the seed of love.
- Disconnection is not the end—it is the beginning of attachment.
- Even without clarity, your faith counts.
- True healing comes not by fighting your internal chaos but by anchoring it to something higher, by integrating even the "imprisoned" parts of your soul into divine unity.

#### Story

### A story of transformation through "poverty" of the soul

In the 1970s, a young woman named Deborah was institutionalized for chronic depression. She had been diagnosed as "emotionally unresponsive" and had stopped speaking for weeks. One therapist, a Hasidic Jew and Holocaust survivor, was assigned to her. Instead of trying to push her to talk, he began to sit with her each morning, humming quiet niggunim (melodies) under his breath.

Weeks passed.

One morning, as he hummed "Acheinu kol beis Yisrael", he saw a tear roll down her cheek.

He whispered gently, "It's okay if you don't have words. Even silence can reach Heaven."

Months later, she told him: "When you sat there silently, you were saying: *Even in your emptiness, you matter.* That saved me."

She recovered fully. Became a therapist herself.

This is בְּחֲמוּ נַחְמוּ -not the comfort of explanation, but the comfort of presence. When someone sits with your poverty and sees its hidden wealth.

Source: Clinical memoirs of Dr. Tzvi H., published in "The Psychology of Soul," 1994, New York. END NOTE